

Contents / Sommaire

Editorial by Marie-Claire Phélippeau 3

In Memoriam Dominic Baker-Smith 7

Articles

Gabriela Schmidt, *Of Travellers, Messengers and Foundlings – Fictionality, Authorship, and Textual Property in Thomas More’s Paratexts* 17

Michael W. Zhang, *Boethian Philosophy in Sir Thomas More’s Familial Portrait* 45

Guillaume Navaud, *Otherness in More’s Utopia* 73

Jerry Harp, *More’s Utopia and Never-Ending Dialogue* 95

Alvaro Silva, *Utopia’s Best Reader* 115

Frank Mitjans, *St. Thomas More and St. John Chrysostom* 129

Régis Augustus Bars Closesl, *Fictional Remembrances of Sir Thomas More: Part II/II - The Seventeenth Century* 143

Hannah Lucas, *Locating More: The Dialogical Gardenscapes of Thomas More and Ellis Heywood’s Il Moro* 179

Joshua Avery, *Soldierly Training in Two Merry Tales from More’s Dialogue of Comfort Against Tribulation* 197

Sophie Baize-Vézier, *Musique et récusance : enfermement, identité, circulation* 211

Décembre 2016

Time
rieth
ruth

Ce numéro de décembre 2016 clôt la série des *Moreana* dont j'ai été responsable depuis près de dix ans et je suis heureuse de passer le flambeau de la rédaction à un jeune et brillant universitaire, Dr Travis Curtright, professeur à l'Université Ave Maria, en Floride et *fellow* du Center for Thomas More Studies de l'Université de Dallas. Il a déjà un bon nombre de publications à son actif, dont le très acclamé *The One Thomas More*, des références solides et un enthousiasme créatif que j'ai pu apprécier dans les divers séminaires qui nous ont réunis.

Comme je vous l'ai fait savoir plus tôt, la revue sera dorénavant publiée par les Presses Universitaires d'Edimbourg (EUP), ce qui confèrera à *Moreana* une plus grande autorité, une assise universitaire conforme aux attentes académiques actuelles et, nous l'espérons, une diffusion nettement plus large. La grande nouveauté sera sa diffusion numérique. Il sera donc possible de s'abonner à la revue soit en version numérique soit en version imprimée et de consulter les numéros anciens de *Moreana*, maintenant tous mis en ligne sur le site d'EUP. La revue demeurant la propriété de l'association *Amici Thomae Mori*, ses membres bénéficieront d'un privilège particulier : l'accès en ligne à moindre coût à l'ensemble des anciens numéros.

Etre rédactrice en chef de la revue fut une belle aventure, et je ne peux rappeler aucun aspect négatif. Même le travail intense qui précède chaque bouclage de numéro, s'il comporte un surcroît de stress, reste toujours une période excitante, une forme de course contre la montre où se décident les dernières illustrations et les ajustements ultimes qui requièrent un surcroît de créativité. Travailler est un jeu, surtout lorsqu'à deux, nous décidons de nous épauler en nous amusant. Le jour où Hubert, mon mari, déclara : « si on doit passer la nuit à travailler, il faut manger ! » la perspective de la pause

café-croissant d'après minuit nous a fait anticiper les nuits de travail avec gourmandise.

Les nombreuses rencontres d'auteurs devenus des amis sont certainement ce que je retiendrai de plus gratifiant dans ce travail de rédaction. S'il m'a toujours été douloureux de refuser un article à un auteur, j'ai en revanche été honorée de publier des textes d'une grande qualité, des idées nouvelles et éclairantes, des approches inédites. En tant qu'enseignante, j'ai appris beaucoup ; en tant que rédactrice, énormément. Je veux donc remercier tous les auteurs et tous les lecteurs, et dire à mon successeur combien je lui suis reconnaissante de reprendre le flambeau de la rédaction.

Je souhaite bon vent, pour longtemps, à *Moreana*.

Marie-Claire Phélippeau

Moreana Editor

moreana.editor@moreana.org

December 2016

Time
rieth
ruth

This December 2016 issue closes the series of *Moreana* for which I have been responsible for nearly ten years. I am happy to pass on the torch of the editorship to a young and brilliant scholar, Dr. Travis Curtright, professor at Ave Maria University in Florida. A fellow of the Center for Thomas More Studies at the University of Dallas, he has already authored a good number of publications, among which the much applauded *The One Thomas More*. Dr. Curtright comes to us with the warmest recommendations and a creative enthusiasm I have admired in the various seminars we both attended.

As I let you know earlier, the journal will from now on be published by Edinburgh University Press (EUP). With this change *Moreana* will gain more authority, a university support in keeping with current academic expectations, and, so we hope, a much larger circulation. The great novelty of this move will be the online accessibility of the journal. It will now be possible to subscribe to the digital and/or the print version of *Moreana* and to access all the back issues on the EUP website. The journal remains the property of *Amici Thomae Mori* society, and its members will benefit from a special privilege: a low-cost online access to all the back issues.

Being the Editor of the journal has been a marvelous adventure, a journey in which I cannot recall a single negative experience. While it always meant additional stress, even the intense work preceding each publisher's deadline always remained an exciting time. It became a race against the clock when the last illustrations needed to be selected, the ultimate adjustments made, all requiring an additional surge of creativity. At times, work also became play, especially when our party of two would have fun collaborating. From the day when Hubert, my husband, declared "if we're going to work through the night, we might as well eat," the perspective of an after-midnight coffee-with-croissant break made us ravenously anticipate these working nights.

The many meetings with authors, some of them now friends, are certainly among the best memories I will keep from being the Editor of *Moreana*. If I always found it painful to turn down an article, I have also been honored to publish texts of a rare quality, new and enlightening ideas and novel approaches. As a professor, I learned a lot—and as an editor, even more so. Therefore I wish to thank all the authors and all our readers, and say to my successor how grateful I am to him for taking up the torch as the new editor of *Moreana*.

I wish our journal a fair and long journey.

Marie-Claire Phélippeau

Moreana Editor

moreana.editor@moreana.org

In Memoriam

Dominic Baker-Smith

Professor Dominic Baker-Smith died peacefully on Friday 26 August, 2016. He will be sadly missed by us all.

As his friend **David Baird-Smith**, who first met him at Cambridge University in the 1970's, likes to recall, "In the line with Thomas More, Dominic, as a gentleman and a scholar, combined erudition and friendship most naturally." The same friend adds, "He was a most attentive host and an easy guest. His advice and experience in the education of children in the 20th century were always a precious and sympathetic source of support."¹

Less than a year ago, we were exchanging emails with Professor Baker-Smith who entrusted us with his very friendly letter to **Professor Elizabeth McCutcheon**, whom we honored in her *Liber Amicorum*, also our December 2015 *Moreana*. She pays her tribute to her friend here.

Frank Mitjans, from the *Thomas More Institute*, London, recalls privileged moments he shared with Professor Baker-Smith. We wish to thank Mrs. Veronica Baker-Smith for allowing *Moreana* to publish some extracts from their correspondence. These are rare lines, which testify to a whole life in the company of Thomas More.

* * *

¹ See the *Gazette Thomas More* No.34 (December 2016) for David Baird-Smith's whole tribute.

Professor Elizabeth McCutcheon:

I know I speak for all of us whose lives and understanding were enriched by the many contributions of Dominic-Baker Smith. His path and mine crossed several times when we attended the same conferences in Europe. Unfortunately, I did not get to know him personally, but I long admired him as an extraordinary scholar, who wrote both brilliantly and eloquently, bringing new light to every topic he explored. He made scholarship look easy, belying his mastery of several fields: he seemed equally at home in philosophy, theology, and literature, and could balance the most precise detail with a grasp of ideas that opened up a text or an author and inevitably encouraged us to read more deeply and look eagerly for his next publication.

I first became aware of his work through his brilliant essay, "The Escape from the Cave: Thomas More and the Vision of Utopia," in *Dutch Quarterly Review* 15, no. 3 (1985): 148-61, reprinted in *Between Dream and Nature: Essays on Utopia and Dystopia*, edited by Dominic Baker-Smith and C. C. Barfoot (Amsterdam: Rodolpi, 1987), 5-19. And it was my great pleasure to review his splendid new translation of Thomas More's *Utopia* (London: Penguin Classics, 2012) for *Moreana*. I was also honored by the request of Ton Hoenselaars and Arthur F. Kinney to contribute an essay to *Challenging Humanism: Essays in Honor of Dominic Baker-Smith* (Newark: University of Delaware Press, 2005). And it was a special privilege to find Dominic's letter to me in my *Liber Amicorum*, which included a very learned exposition of hymnology by way of More's epigrams on Henry Abyngdon, but began "My dear Elizabeth," echoing the title of my monograph on More's prefatory letter to Peter Giles in his *Utopia*. This says much about Dominic, who was, as Frank Mitjans points out, a gentleman, a scholar, and a man of great faith.

Dominic Baker-Smith was admirably fit to interpret Thomas More. I am very touched by his perception of More as a Christian who embraced a new form of vocation for the layman. And I am sorry that

Dominic was not able to fully develop this provocative and empathic insight. But he has left us a great legacy, which will enrich and stimulate readers and researchers for years and years to come. (For a sense of just some of Dominic's work, see the bibliography included in *Challenging Humanism*, pages 311-317, which spans the period from 1963-2005.) Thankfully, he outlived this bibliography, continuing to enlarge our understanding of More as long as he lived. Like Thomas More, who was so close to Dominic Baker-Smith's mind and heart, Dominic himself was a man of grace, fortitude, and faith: in short, a man for all seasons.

Elizabeth McCutcheon,
Professor Emerita, University of Hawaii
November 17, 2016.

* * *

Frank Mitjans:

Dominic Baker-Smith was a gentleman, a scholar, and a man of great faith. Educated first at The Oratory School, Woodcote, nr. Reading, he graduated from Trinity College, Cambridge. After teaching in Canada he returned to Cambridge where he became a Fellow of Fitzwilliam College and a Lecturer in the Faculty of English. In 1976 he was appointed Professor of English at University College, Cardiff, and later Professor of English at the University of Amsterdam (1981–1998). He took early retirement from the University of Amsterdam for medical reasons and returned to England. During his last eighteen years he continued his research and writing. In 2000 the University of Toronto published the second edition of his *More's Utopia*. He was the editor of *The Expositions of the Psalms*, volumes 63–65 of the *Collected Works of Erasmus* (2005–2010), and he contributed the chapter, “Reading Utopia”, in *The Cambridge Companion to Thomas More* (2011). Late in the summer of 2012 Penguin published his new translation into English of Thomas More's *Utopia*; and in March 2014 he published the entry on “Thomas More” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.

Professor Baker-Smith's last message to me is dated 6 July 2016, the *dies natalis* of St Thomas More, seven weeks before his death. After updating me about his medical condition he ended the first paragraph with a striking statement:

Still, as you know, I'm fairly obsessed about More as a pioneer of the lay vocation.

He continued:

His sense of vocation is necessarily flexible: a successful lawyer, an assiduous courtier and diplomat, and a retired man of prayer, all according to his circumstances. The key, I suggest, lies in the kind of life

sketched by Walter Hilton (admired by More, as you say) whose little treatise 'Of the Meddled (= mixed) Life' covers the theme as realized in – say – the ideal of the Friar, but then includes certain laymen, those who have wealth and authority over others. A bit strange at first glance, but a life of prayer and contemplation requires privacy, and at the close of the Middle Ages only the wealthy could hope for that. Even graduate students at Oxford shared about 6 or 8 to a chamber. I don't know about More's situation at Bucklersbury, but when after 1523 he designs his ideal house at Chelsea it includes a chapel, a library, and a gallery (a lay cloister in effect). There he would retire in solitude as circumstances allowed. But then he would emerge in that classic rhythm to engage with the active life, and for that you needed authority. If any old person tried to start instructing others they would soon end up in the bishop's prison as a suspected Lollard. Some years ago I did do some research on who went to More's 1501 lectures on Augustine's City of God. The conclusion I reached was that the overwhelming number would have been lawyers, not just Common lawyers from the Westminster courts but Civil lawyers from the court of Admiralty and such, and Canon lawyers from the court of Arches, as well as what we could call the higher civil service. The law was the one learned profession where laymen could function. My obsession is based on a key passage in Augustine (City of God, Book XIX, c.6) where he raises the question, 'Given that social life is surrounded by such darkness, will the wise man take his seat on the judges' bench, or will he not venture to do so? Clearly, he will take his seat; for the claims of human society, which he thinks it wicked to abandon, constrain him and draw him to this duty.' I believe that this is a hugely important passage for More: rather than seeing him as a 'failed monk' (as so

many do) or being dragged by his insensitive father from his literary studies, we can see him as drawn by a steady sense of vocation to commit himself to God's work through this mixed life. Erasmus never quite grasped this. The passage itself seems to echo one in Plato's Republic (592) which has importance for Utopia and which argues that the wise man will not be active in 'the city of his birth'. Following Augustine, More reverses this in a Christian acceptance of an imperfect social order which can be ameliorated by charity. And his career is that progress; first as a socially aware lawyer and then as a courtier/counselor whose major achievement in his own view (see the epitaph on himself that he sent to Erasmus) was his part in the achievement of peace at the treaty of Cambrai in 1529. Only when his active role is blocked after 1532 does he retire to a life of prayer — though even then he is hard at work on controversy. I think that it all adds up to a very consistent whole, which matches Hilton's ideal. But in conventional terms of religious vocation it is groundbreaking, and that explains why so many biographers miss the point. Failed monk, my eye! Some of the things he says in his 'Letter to a Monk' of 1518 make your hair stand on end. I am sorry to go on so, but you set my mind humming. I haven't had any excuse to write about More for some time. I hope all goes well with you.

As ever, Dominic

Professor Baker-Smith advised me to avoid long quotations but this email of July 2016 simply cries out to be transcribed at length. He cites More's own epitaph that he sent in a letter to Erasmus. This piece of Dominic sent by email reads in fact as *his* own epitaph. It was written in a hurry but the content had been pondered calmly for a while, as is manifest from his having postponed the writing of it for some weeks and the precise citations he gave. With variable nuances

the content had come up at various times during our conversations. In the email, for instance, he mentions that “a life of prayer and contemplation requires privacy.” This is true but Dominic, speaking of More’s early choices, pointed out also that any young man with a Christian background will consider early on in life his own vocation. The tumult of life and shared chambers are not as such obstacles to reflection (Dominic’s reference to shared room of 6 or 8 at Oxford might well be in fact a reminiscence of his own stay at The Oratory School from 1950 to 1955; in the first years there, aged 13-16, he would have shared a small dormitory with a group of boys of about that size). More used to meditate while walking, as was reported by Erasmus and as he himself wrote to Colet. He would have made his choice for a life of prayer and contemplation in the very midst of his work as a lawyer. At some stage Dominic made the point that it was all very well to admire More’s martyrdom by the axe, but it is surely the case that the City lawyers need to emulate his life as a professional man, too.

The citation of Plato in the email of 6 July 2016 is expanded in Dominic’s *More’s Utopia* where he wrote: ‘One work which can be seen as a direct response to the Socratic ambiguities of Book IX [of Plato’s *Republic* (592)] is St Augustine’s *The City of God* on which More lectured at St Lawrence Jewry in 1501 [...] His two cities, the city of the world and the City of God, can be seen as an adaptation of the two cities mentioned by Socrates’ (*More’s Utopia*, 2000, p.214). The passage from *De civitate Dei* quoted in July 2016 was in fact mentioned in an email dated 14 April 2014 wherein Dominic wrote:

Another point was the issue of More’s “vocation”. In my Stanford entry I aired the idea that I have had for some time, that in a sense the Charterhouse was a ‘red-herring’: St Thomas no doubt benefitted from lodging in property owned by the Carthusians which gave him close contact with their life, but there is so much about his life that suggests a firm sense of vocation. I suggest there that it was Augustine who set him on the line of law as a service

to the Christian community, referring to the De civitate Dei, XIX, 6, where it is stated that even 'In his tenebris vitae socialis' the qualified Christian will take his seat as judge, 'for the claims of human society, which he thinks it wicked to abandon, constrain him and draw him to his duty'. St Thomas must have approved of that [...]. I do suggest there, as well, that he could get the basis for all this from Walter Hilton's Treatise on the Mixed Life where he presents the case for a lay fusion of spiritual withdrawal and practical social action.

That email of 14 April 2014 had started:

Reading about More's hair shirt made me reflect that while I haven't done much in the way of corporal mortification, I am getting what is needed in the course of nature. As Veronica pushed me up to Communion in my wheel chair yesterday I could reflect that this Lent has been much more uncomfortable than any others, but also more profitable. I have taken up the Dialogue of Comfort again, but now not for academic purposes but spiritual instruction. It is rather a joy to feel that personal encounter with More, with no concern for an academic 'audience'.

Three weeks later he wrote:

"I'm still glued to the Dialogue of Comfort which I do indeed find comforting."

In these recent years I have also had the opportunity of working with Dominic for the Spanish edition of James McConica's *Brief Biography of Thomas More*. Dominic was the point of my contact with McConica; they had been good friends since their youth, and McConica dated the Preface of his book from Dominic's home. McConica wanted Dominic to write the "Introduction" to the Spanish edition, which was published in February 2016. In Dominic's piece

St Augustine's idea of the wise man's engagement with earthly realities reappears, but the main point to bear in mind is that it is an introduction to a short work in which the author writes that "what is clearest from [More's] youthful ideals is his calling to the service of Christendom through scholarship and the renewal of the commonweal" and wherein he states that More "understood marriage as a vocation" (James McConica, *Thomas More*, 1977, pp.10 and 14).

In regard to Dominic's reference to the text of the epitaph engraved in Chelsea Old Church and sent by letter to Erasmus, More wrote at the outset that he was *in literis utcunque versatus*, which Dominic translated "constantly engaged in letters in one way or another." The phrase could well be applied to Dominic himself, and More's description of his father as "an affable man, charming, irreproachable, gentle, merciful, fair and upright" might also be applied to Dominic.

Frank Mitjans,
24 September 2016.